



High Resolves
Creating Citizens & Leaders

Making the Case for Citizenship Education

Orange Paper #1



Making the Case for Citizenship Education

We live in polarizing times. Democracy, and the liberal values of diversity and tolerance on which it depends, are under siege. The causes of these issues are complex and the barriers to overcoming them are many, but broadening the reach and quality of citizenship education offers a vital, untapped path to addressing these problems.

Citizenship education, as traditionally defined¹ and practiced, normally happens on the level of the nation-state. Its meaning therefore typically reflects the values of a nation-state, and can take democratic and non-democratic, militaristic and pacifistic forms. And even within nation-states, especially democratic ones, the meaning of citizenship can become the subject of heated political and pedagogical debate. But if one accepts that democracy is worth preserving and that it embodies a set of common values that theoretically transcend divisions of race, class, gender, and Left/Right politics, then one can imagine citizenship education as being essential to binding the wounds that increasingly divide us within and across national boundaries.

Since World War II, citizenship education has gradually lost its sway to the point that today it is rarely practiced.² It first retreated in the face of a global reaction against authority and indoctrination, which followed the war and gained momentum with the rise of anti-colonial and civil rights movements. It took a further hit with the rise of the Asian economies and a determination in the West to ensure global competitiveness by re-orienting educational curricula around basic skills – reading, math, and science – deemed essential to the creation of productive economic units and growth.

The incentives established for teachers to teach these skills to the exclusion of other subjects have proven a powerful deterrent to the reintroduction of citizenship education, even where it has bipartisan political support. Whatever the metric – class time spent, standards, teacher training, use of proven, science-based pedagogies – we’re devoting less to citizenship in schools today, not more.

The resilience of democracy has proven no less contingent on citizenship education than the economy is on skills training. At least in the United States, a shockingly high percentage of students have little knowledge of the basic structure of democratic institutions, why they exist, what they do, or how they function.³ U.S. 8th graders have made no academic progress in basic civics since 2010: fewer than one-third of students scored proficient or better on civics tests, and only three percent or fewer scored at the advanced level in the subject.⁴ The not unpredictable result is an increasing lack of appreciation for democracy as opposed to other potential forms of government.⁵ And, in turn, this lack of appreciation has been one contributor to the rise of authoritarian regimes, a rejection of democratic and international institutions, and a reaction against immigration and increase in tribalism generally.

“

Whatever the metric – class time spent, standards, teacher training, use of proven, science-based pedagogies – we’re devoting less to citizenship in schools today, not more

1 For a traditional definition of citizenship education see T.H. Marshall’s definition in Topolski & Leuven, 2008, p. 262

2 Neal, 2017; Pondiscio. 2016

3 Burgoyne-Allen, 2017; Kahlenberg & Janey, 2016

4 Shapiro & Brown, 2018

5 <http://www.journalofdemocracy.org/sites/default/files/Foa%26Mounk-27-3.pdf>

Fortunately, we are increasingly seeing a “happy convergence between the skills most needed in the global knowledge economy and those most needed to keep our democracy safe and vibrant.”⁶ Because citizens are made not born, education systems around the world have a crucial role to play in their making. Well beyond a simple knowledge of the workings of government, true citizenship education has the potential to forge national and international identities grounded in universal principles of human freedom, dignity, equality of opportunity, limited (but not necessarily small) government, and economics and social justice. The knowledge, dispositions and skills that enable effective citizenship must be taught as systematically as we teach math, language arts and science – from the knowledge of how democracies work, to the dispositions to embrace diversity and difference, to the skills for self-awareness and independent thinking, participating in groups, advocating for justice, engaging in civil discourse, collaborating effectively, and practicing inclusive leadership.

Indeed, 30+ years of evidence suggests high-quality citizenship education can contribute to improvements in both academic and non-academic outcomes.⁷ Documented benefits include:

- Supports academic success for all students.⁸
- Contributes to the reduction of academic achievement gaps for at-risk student populations.⁹
- Fosters civic knowledge, skills and dispositions, preparing students for informed, effective participation in our democracy.¹⁰
- Builds 21st century college and career readiness skills, including media literacy, collaboration and communication, critical thinking and problem solving.¹¹
- Lowers dropout rates and improves students’ chances of staying in school by making learning relevant and engaging.¹²
- Improves school climate as young people learn respectful dialogue, teamwork and appreciation of diversity.¹³
- Strengthens the engagement and relationships of schools and students with parents, families, civic leaders and organizations, and community partners.¹⁴



To accelerate progress ...the education sector should invest in a global ‘ecosystem’ for education that will promote cross-border learning and sharing of innovations and grow the capacity of leaders and practitioners

We know more than ever about what high quality citizenship education looks like, and have sufficient tools and resources for teaching it effectively, from active pedagogical techniques, to real world applications like action civics, to simulations, to programs. More evidence will be useful, but the science of learning, and the leadership and evidence base generated by widely implemented citizenship programs over 30+ years, provides a blueprint for immediate, research-based action sufficient to inform more widespread and systematic citizenship education.¹⁵

6 Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, 2015

7 Brennan, 2017

8 Cohen, et al., 2009; Dávila & Mora, 2007); Torney-Purta & Lopez, 2006

9 Kahne & Sporte, 2008; Campbell, 2008

10 Vercellotti & Matto, 2010; Carnegie Corporation and CIRCLE, 2003

11 Partnership for 21st Century Skills, 2013; Torney-Purta & Wilkenfeld, 2009

12 Starks, 2010; Dávila & Mora, 2007

13 Facing History and Ourselves, (accessed March 30, 2017); Flanagan, et al., 2010; The Carnegie Foundation and CIRCLE, 2006

14 Guilfoile, et al., 2016; Wilkenfeld, 2009

15 Gould, et al., 2011

And through a collective, global ecosystem approach that relies on knowledge and practice sharing, we can move the field forward even faster. “To accelerate progress ...the education sector should invest in a global ‘ecosystem’ for education that will promote cross-border learning and sharing of innovations and grow the capacity of leaders and practitioners”.¹⁶

Given the urgency of the need, the mounting evidence of impact, and the readiness of the field to go to scale, the real question we need to ask is not “Why Citizenship Education?” but rather: “What are we waiting for?” We must question why we haven’t invested much more heavily in this important area, and we are left to wonder what crisis of democracy, injustice and social conflict it will take to open up the level of institutional investment in citizenship education the world so clearly needs.

If we want to be able to thrive in a world that is both free and diverse, and to solve the problems of the 21st century – the knottiest of which can only be solved through global collective action – then we must reverse course and deeply and systematically invest in citizenship education in secondary schools, and just as systematically strengthen the citizenship education ecosystem worldwide.

High Resolves is a non-partisan, non-religious, non-profit social venture specializing in the design and delivery of immersive learning experiences around citizenship themes for young people. The Orange Papers series are designed to share our insights and learnings to advance the discourse in this important arena.

¹⁶ Center for Global Education, et al., 2018

Works Cited

- Brennan, Jan (April 2017). ESSA: Mapping Opportunities for Civic Education. Education Commission of the States.
- Burgoyne-Allen, Phillip (Sep 17, 2017). "Can Your Name The Branches of Government? Most Americans Can't." Ahead of the Heard.
- Campbell, David (2008). "Voice in the Classroom: How an Open Classroom Climate Fosters Political Engagement among Adolescents." *Political Behavior*, 30(4), 445.
- Carnegie Corporation and CIRCLE (2003). "The Civic Mission of Schools." New York: NY, Carnegie Corporation. Retrieved from <https://civicyouth.org/special-report-the-civic-mission-of-schools/>
- Center for Global Education at Asia Society, Results for Development, Teach For All, The Boston Consulting Group, and World Innovation Summit for Education (2018). Investing in Knowledge Sharing to Advance SDG 4. The Education Commission.
- Cohen, Jonathan, McCabe, Libby, Michelli and Terry Pickeral (2009). "School Climate: Research, Policy, Teacher Education and Practice." *Teachers College Record*, 111(1), 183.
- Dávila, Alberto and Marie Mora (2007). "CIRCLE Working Paper 52: Civic Engagement and High School Academic Progress: An Analysis Using NELS Data." Medford, MA: Tufts University. Retrieved from <https://civicyouth.org/circle-working-paper-52-civic-engagement-and-high-school-academic-progress-an-analysis-using-nels-data/>
- Facing History and Ourselves (accessed March 30, 2017). "Dennis Barr". Retrieved from <https://www.facinghistory.org/bullying-case-study-ostracism/dennis-barr>
- Flanagan, Constance, Tara Stoppa, Amy K. Syvertsen and Michael Stout (2010). "Schools and Social Trust," in Lonnie R. Sherrod, Judith Torney-Purta, and Constance Flanagan (eds.), *Handbook of Research on Civic Engagement in Youth*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley, 318–319.
- Gould, Jonathan, Kathleen Hall Jamieson, Peter Levine, Ted McConnell, and David B. Smith, eds. (2011). *Guardian of Democracy: The Civic Mission of Schools*. The Leonore Annenberg Institute for Civics of the Annenberg Public Policy Center at the University of Pennsylvania and the Campaign for the Civic Mission of Schools.
- Guifoile, Lisa, Brady Delander, and Carol Krek (2016). *Guidebook: Six Proven Practices for Effective Civic Learning*. Denver: Education Commission of the States. https://www.ecs.org/wp-content/uploads/Six-proven-practices-update_r2.pdf
- <http://www.journalofdemocracy.org/sites/default/files/Foa%26Mounk-27-3.pdf>
- Kahlenberg, Richard and Clifford Janey (Nov. 10, 2016). "Putting Democracy Back into Public Education." The Century Foundation.
- Kahne, Joseph and Susan Spote (2008). "Developing Citizens: The Impact of Civic Learning Opportunities on Students' Commitment to Civic Participation." *American Educational Research Journal*, 45(3), 755.
- Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (June 2015). *Preparing Citizens: Report on Civic Learning and Engagement*, Working Group on Civic Learning and Engagement for the Massachusetts Board of Elementary and Secondary Education. Retrieved from <http://www.doe.mass.edu/candi/StandardsReview/CivicReport.pdf>

Neal, Andrea (Nov. 2, 2017) "We've Failed at Civic Education." Springfield News-Leader.

Partnership for 21st Century Skills (2013). Reimagining Citizenship for the 21st Century: A Call to Action for Policymakers and Educators.

Pondiscio, Robert (Nov. 22, 2016). "Now or Never for Civics Education." U.S. News and World Report.

Shapiro, Sarah and Catherin Brown (2018, Feb 21). The State of Civics Education. Center for American Progress. Retrieved from <https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/>

Starks, Charlane Fay (2013). "Connecting Civic Education to Civil Right and Responsibility: A Strategy for Reducing High School Dropout Among African American Students," Sacramento: CA, Sacramento State University, 32-38, <http://csus-dspace.calstate.edu/handle/10211.9/512>

The Carnegie Foundation and CIRCLE (2006). "Higher Education: Civic Mission & Civic Effects," Stanford, CA: The Carnegie Foundation. http://civicyouth.org/PopUps/higher_ed_civic_mission_and_civic_effects.pdf

The Effects of Political Discussion on Youth Knowledge and Efficacy." Medford, MA: Tufts University. Retrieved from <https://civicyouth.org/featured-the-classroom-kitchen-table-connection-the-effects-of-political-discussion-on-youth-knowledge-and-efficacy/>

Topolski, Anna and K.U. Leuven (2008). "Creating Citizens in the Classroom: Hannah Arendt's Political Critique of Education in Ethical Perspectives." Journal of the European Ethics Network. 15(2) 2008, 262.

Torney-Purta, Judith and Britt Wilkenfeld (2009). "Paths to 21st Century Competencies through Civic Education Classrooms: An Analysis of Survey Results from Ninth Graders." American Bar Association, Division for Public Education. Retrieved from http://www.americanbar.org/content/dam/aba/images/public_education/civiclearningresource_booklet_lores.pdf

Torney-Purta, Judith and Susan Vermeer Lopez (2006). "Developing Citizenship Competencies from Kindergarten through Grade 12: A Background Paper for Policymakers and Educators." Denver, CO: Education Commission of the States. Retrieved from <http://www.ecs.org/clearinghouse/51/35/5135.pdf>

Vercellotti, Tim and Elizabeth Matto (2010). "CIRCLE Working Paper 72: The Classroom-Kitchen Table Connection: The Effects of Political Discussion on Youth Knowledge and Efficacy," Medford, MA: Tufts University. Retrieved from <https://civicyouth.org/featured-the-classroom-kitchen-table-connection-the-effects-of-political-discussion-on-youth-knowledge-and-efficacy/>

Wilkenfeld, Britt (2009). "CIRCLE Working Paper 64: Does Context Matter? How the Family, Peer, School and Neighborhood Contexts Relate to Adolescents' Civic Engagement." Medford, MA: Tufts University. <http://www.civicyouth.org/PopUps/WorkingPapers/WP64Wilkenfeld.pdf>